

## Two Instructional Frameworks for Job Application Writing: Conventional ESP- Based Strategy Versus Genre-Analysis Based Strategy

Zahra Khan<sup>1</sup> and Sajida Zaki<sup>2</sup>

### ABSTRACT

*Writing professional genre is considered as a challenging task and writing professional job application letters by novice job applicants is a problem as they are unaware of the features of this genre as expected by the disciplinary community, and variations according to the job and the employer. All through tertiary level education, Job Application Letter (JAL) is considered as an essential genre taught as a mandatory component of English for purpose-specific courses. As reported by many students, discipline-specific professors, recruiters and employers that, despite receiving formal education, graduates continue to show lack of specific skills required in writing an effective JAL which in turn could help them get short-listed for job interviews. Research-based and literary work done on Second Language, Academic and Specific English Writing has identified writing instruction and teacher's pedagogy as important factors for this problem. A quasi experimental study was conducted, forming two homogeneous groups (N1=37; N2=40) which included 5<sup>th</sup> semester engineering students pursuing their bachelor's degree in the same department at a public-sector university. Each of the two homogeneous groups was taught for four weeks using one strategy. Pre-test and post-test design along with student's perceptions before and after the study provided the qualitative and quantitative data to make comparisons within and across groups to study the impact of each strategy as well as the comparison of the two strategies. Result are drawn from descriptive and correlational analysis and t-test done on the quantitative data, whereas thematic analysis is followed through for the qualitative data for the similar purpose. The differences in the result of mean average scores (GABI pretest:9.79, posttest: 19.94; CBCBI pretest:10.16 posttest:16.81 revealed that genre-analysis based strategy influenced student's JAL writing more and showed improvement. Furthermore, the qualitative data revealed that students found structured instruction, practice and feedbacks useful and inductive in developing their interest in writing and writing classes. It becomes evident that student's JAL writing skills directly affects their employability, but it can be improved by altering formerly used strategies or by the use of a more promising JAL writing skills GABI.*

**KEYWORDS:** Job application, genre analysis, ESP, genre writing, classroom instruction

### INTRODUCTION

Genre has gained much of its importance in the field of research and second language teaching. Contemporarily, the idea of genre moves towards the analysis and descriptions, not only in the field of linguistics and language teaching but also in the domain of cultural as well as social studies (Hyland, 2004). Number of research studies analyzed professional and academic genre to see the language usage in different discourse community. Present-day studies put Genre Analysis-based instruction (GABI) to use in teaching the graduates mainly the job application genre. The main aim of the genre of job application letter (JAL) is persuasive in nature, that is to be expecting a specific response from the receiver's side, explicitly a call for an interview. Another reviewed literature opined that JAL contains applicant's information which vary in different parts of the world in terms of what is asked of them in the document. Adding to this, the information contained in this genre is the first professional image of the applicants in writing which attempts to impress the employers, so much that they would give it a read. Mostly, research studies on JAL genre

---

<sup>1</sup> Lecturer of English, Bharia University, Karachi. Email: [zkhan8011@gmail.com](mailto:zkhan8011@gmail.com)

<sup>2</sup> Professor and Chairperson, Humanities Department, NED University of Engineering & Technology, Karachi. Email: [drzaki@neduet.edu.pk](mailto:drzaki@neduet.edu.pk)

focused on the impact of feedback but does not incorporate GABI that prepares students to meet the real-world writing style and give them confidence to handle professional genres.

## **THE STUDY GAP**

The research gap in the context of Pakistan as discussed by Mahmood, Ain, Umer and Qasim (2015) that the Pakistani applicant face problems in writing the job application letter and there is a dire need to facilitate Pakistani graduates in terms of professional discourse. Researchers also examined that very few studies have been conducted in the Pakistani context on job letters; there is a need to expand research. In terms of “typical formulaic expressions”, Khan and Tin (2012) reported that most candidates fail to use inventive language of the genre due to distinctive abilities and accomplishments which does not necessarily prepare them to do that or educate them in that way. Moreover, in the professional correspondence in Pakistan, applicants still resort to use the old patterns with courteous expressions as well as using less creative language that leads to incoherence in organization of ideas (Ain, Mahmood, & Asim, 2015). Furthermore, the research gap identified regarding employment projects, relatively not as much has been written to facilitate the students to completely understand the employment projects and engage them in revision of these documents of employment projects (Ding & Ding, 2013). Yang (2012) also presents an important research gap as experimental and theoretical studies acknowledged the importance of genre - based approaches. Thus, learner’s attitudes and perceptions related to genre- based learning is less explored.

However, Ho, Watkin and Kelly (2001) have attempted to draw attention towards the major research gap that in higher education there is limited literature that is available based on staff development approaches. Moreover, research studies are required at the level of higher education to align their traditional pedagogy with respect to the modifications of demanding environment (Zaki, Rashidi, & Kazmi, 2013). In addition, in the context of Pakistan the development of teachers at tertiary level with respect to professionalism is still a challenging area to work on. In the context of professional growth in Pakistan, neither research nor scholarship availability are promoted or provided to the university teachers, to develop their views regarding teaching. Therefore, even the Pakistani teachers needs guidance and needs to be taught in order to develop professionalism in them (Chaudary, 2011) and there is a need for teacher’s pre-service as well as in-service education in the Pakistani context (Dayoub & Basiruddin, 2012).

Ashraf and Rarieya (2008) conclude that in the Pakistani context, teachers should be made aware of reflective practices and require reflective conversations to improve their teaching. By drawing upon the concept of recruiters, Breaugh and Starke (2000) have been able to show that more attention is required by the recipients of realistic job previews that is helpful for the job applicants. At a local Pakistani context, undergraduate learners face problems in writing (Freed, Almas & Bilal, 2016). In view of the above analysis that have been mentioned so far, one may suppose that there is a pressing need to develop undergraduate students’ professional writing skills because soon after graduation students meets the real monetary world. Besides these, teaching practices of job application professional genre also gives a traditional look that is also the major problem. Considering the gap in the instructional methods, the study incorporates genre analysis-based instruction as an upgrading in teaching this professional genre.

## **LITERATURE REVIEW**

### **INSTRUCTIONAL FRAME WORK:**

## CONVENTIONAL BUSINESS COMMUNICATION BASED INSTRUCTION (CBCBI)

Quality education is essential at the level of higher education, because institutions are striving to produce the best of us and the competition of surviving in the real market is getting harder and harder on every day basis (Zaki & Rashidi, 2013). Another study opines that Pakistani graduates at tertiary level need to improve their communication skills for better future prospects, but the fruitless language teaching practices are the main reason that scare all the opportunities away (Sultana & Zaki, 2015). This was also observed by Dar, Zaki and Kazmi (2010) that second language learners mainly fail to develop their proficiency academically in their Second language and even training is not given in terms of meeting the professional world requirement. Zaki et al. (2013) revealed that the local context fails to change the current teaching pedagogy that empower learners through knowledge as well as skills that are helpful in contributing effectively in the arena of professional community and society. Another study focused that the developments can take place professionally so that teacher's provisions can take place in terms of work place working criteria. In addition, effective strategies can be used to track graduates so that the updates can be addressed (Bratlien & McGuire, 2002).

One study by Hativa, Barak and Simhi (2001) examined the trends, that different researchers are looking for ways to enhance knowledge about teaching. To achieve this goal one should first start thinking about teaching, knowledge related to pedagogy that will helpful in term of instructions delivered to the teachers those who are less equipped with teaching pedagogy. Moreover, professors at universities have not received any teacher's training that prepares them to teach and for teaching practices. Hence, this situation leads to fragmenting their pedagogical practices. Apart from this, it is necessary to aware teachers in Pakistan in terms of their professional development and different opportunity is also provided to expand their capability. This step gives teachers a base to build their willingness to take part actively that builds them professionally (Rizvi & Elliot, 2007). As Ramsden (1987) also identified that research studies are required so that improvement in the process of learning can take place at higher level of education. The key feature for (CBCBI) is presented in Table 1.

**Table 1. Key features of conventional business communication-based instruction**

Key features
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Imitation</li> <li>• Copying the exact material or teacher's model</li> <li>• Less creative development of skills</li> <li>• No application of writing skills</li> <li>• Less empowering</li> <li>• Less emphasis of different techniques of writing</li> </ul>

Hence, the above description reported that improvement is necessary in the local context in terms of pedagogy that are helpful to empower students towards learning.

## INSTRUCTIONAL FRAMEWORK: GENRE ANALYSIS BASED INSTRUCTION

Genre analysis-based instruction (GABI) is considered as important in understanding the practices. For the students of ESP, the knowledge of genre will be helpful in their academics and professional career (Osman, 2004). Many studies discuss the value of GABI or teaching with reference to the (non-native English speakers) NNEs (Hyland, 1990, 2004, 2007; Kwan, 2006; Payaprom, 2012; Pryde, 2015; Tyron, 2016; Yasuda; 2011). As Hyland (2004) investigated that the framework of ESP genre-based give learners a chance to develop their understanding explicitly in terms of the structure of the target text and the way text is written. Hyland (2007) views genre-based pedagogy as a useful resource for Teacher Educators to assist their pre-service and in-service student-teachers in writing to produce effective text. Moreover, theory and research related to genre gives teachers a useful resource for preparing their materials for writing classes. More to this, genres act as a supporting tool for learners to facilitate their involvement with different types of text (Hyland, 1990).

One study by Kwan (2006) states that little work has been done on genre-based instruction with respect to writing. As, Payaprom (2012) explored that genre-based approach affected positively in the development of student English literacy as this approach helps students to understand the text in a better way, expansion in accessing the examination of genre, explicitly providing knowledge about a genre through the process of teaching and learning as well as providing benefit with respect to using language in order to achieve different purpose of communication. However, Pryde (2015) study revealed that genre-based approach could be helpful in providing students better learning of the successful conversational approach. Much of the available literature deals with the importance of genre approach that can be helpful to interpret and refine standards in terms of “proficiency-based curriculum and instruction” (Tyron, 2016). The study of Yasuda (2011) based on implementing genre based approach to the genre of e-mail writing revealed a significant result in terms of improvement in students thinking level about writing email in English and this implementation raised student’s confidence.

Similarly, Lee (2013) also reported that in the process of teaching and learning, genre can be considered as a useful instrument. Struggling learners especially EFL, considering genre as a useful tool can be helpful contextually in terms of thoughtful construction of passages and provision of guiding principles to the students. Genre-based writing is helpful for teachers as well as learners in the writing classes. It can provide instructions to students related to writing by using genre approach, motivating struggling learners in terms of giving guidelines clearly, and providing help for teachers in terms of practicality and well-organized methods in their writing classes. Another study of Kay and Dudley-Evans (1998) has reviewed the positive aspects of genre-based teaching. It makes the learners aware of the different text type, its features and the strategies to imitate in their own construction. The approach of genre is to make learners empower throughout the world in terms of participation into the specific discourse community. It helps learners in discovering text patterns, promoting cognitive thinking, developing confidence to produce genre-based effective text. It also set learner free from the writing anxiety by providing them varieties of models and providing ways to evaluate their own writing material and hence it provides the useful grounds for teachers as well as students. The key potential benefits (Hyland, 2004) for genre-analysis based writing instructions can be illustrated in the table 2.

**Table.2 Key features for genre analysis-based writing instruction (Adapted from Hyland,2004, pp.10-11)**

Key Features
--------------

- 
- Explicit
  - Systematic
  - Needs-based
  - Supportive
  - Empowering
  - Critical
  - Consciousness-raising
- 

Therefore, using genre-analysis based instruction to teach JAL genre works as an influential teaching tool for teachers as well as benefitting learners.

## MAJOR RESEARCH QUESTIONS

The present research answers the following research questions:

**RQ1:** Do the students of experimental group taught through genre-analysis based strategy perform better than the students in the Control group taught under conventional business communication-based strategy?

**RQ2:** Do pretest and posttest scores of Experimental and Control groups correlate within and across groups? Does the mean change in the outcome from pre-to post differ in the two groups?

## RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The study was quasi- experimental in nature with intact groups of pre-test and post-test design. This quasi-experimental study using quantitative aspects on a group of EFL/ESP learners writing performances in terms of their job application writing tasks. The researcher analyzed data through statistical means and thematic analysis to make comparison of two methods of instruction. In quasi-experimental studies, the groups are intact that means the groups are made in terms of means rather than random selection (Cohen, Manion, & Morrison, 2007). The quasi-experimental study research design known as non-equivalent control group pretest post design was adopted to conduct the intervention, in one department of the public-sector engineering university in Karachi. The research experiment was carried out in the eleventh academic week when the students had almost covered the prescribed syllabus according to the HEC curriculum with the intention that the experiment would not be disturbed by the regular academics. The study was carried out for four weeks during which the experimental group was taught through the GABI whereas, the Control Group was taught through the existing CBCBI.

## FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

To answer the research questions, the major findings have been discussed by following statistical and thematic analysis.

## DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS OF CONTROL AND EXPERIMENTAL GROUP (MEAN, SD, MIN, MAX, RANGE)

For the quantitative analysis, the researchers calculated the range, minimum, maximum, mean and standard deviation. Below is the descriptive analysis of both groups.

### COMPARATIVE DESCRIPTIVE ANALYSIS OF PRETEST AND POSTTEST OF CONTROL GROUP AND EXPERIMENTAL GROUP (AVERAGE OF 3 RATERS)

The Descriptive analysis shows that mean marks in the pretest is 10.16 and SD is 1.419 in the control group. Whereas, in the experimental group mean marks is 9.79 and SD is 2.178 which shows that there was no significant difference between two groups and both groups had a similar level of competency at the start of the study (see table 3 and 4).

**Table 3. Descriptive Statistics of control group**

N=37	Range	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Average control pre-test total (rater 1,2,3)	7	8	14	10.16	1.419
Average control post-test total (rater1,2,3)	10	11	21	16.81	2.042

**Table 4. Descriptive Statistics of experimental group**

N=40	Range	Minimum	Maximum	Mean	Std. Deviation
Average experiment pre-test total (rater 1,2,3)	9.00	4.33	13.33	9.7998	2.17819
Average experiment post-test total (rater1,2,3)	4.34	17.33	21.67	19.9422	1.07471

However, the mean average posttest mark of the control group is 16.81 and standard deviation (SD) is 2.042 (SD). The mean average posttest marks and standard deviation are 19.94 (mean) and 1.075 (SD) in the experimental group. If the SD value is lower that points out the narrower distribution of the scores nearby the mean (Florida department of education,2005) or lower the standard deviation means the scores or values are more clustered together, whereas the higher value gives indication of more dispersion (Babbie, 2008), the data shows a significant difference in their mean achievements of the experimental group and SD was even the lower value that shows that scores of the experimental group (EG) is more bunched together than the control group (CG).

The maximum value in the CG average pretest is 14 and the minimum is 8 so the range of the CG data set is 7, on the contrary the maximum value in the average control group posttest is 21 and the minimum is 11,

so the range is 10. The range values show a contrastive change in the pretest and the post marks. Furthermore, the maximum value of the average pretest of EG is 13.33 and the minimum is 4.33 so the range of EG pretest data set is 9. Oppositely, the maximum value in the average EG posttest total is 21.67 and the minimum is 17.33. So, the range of EG posttest data set is 4.34. If we compare the maximum and minimum value of the CG and EG pretest, posttest average total, then EG show more improvement than the CG. Here the data report the significance of using GABI in the EG.

### **CORRELATION OF PRETEST AND POSTTEST SCORE OF CONTROL GROUP (AVERAGE SCORES BY 3 RATERS)**

The Table 5 shows the correlation of pretest and posttest scores of the control group. The analysis reveals moderate relationship between average pretest and average posttest scores of the control group with the value of 0.470. The significance p value is .003 which is less than 5% significance level. So, at 5% significance level the data provide sufficient evidence to conclude that pretest and posttest scores are related with each other.

**Table 5 Correlation of pretest and posttest average scores of the control group**

N=37		Average pre-test total (rater 1,2,3)	Average post-test total (rater1,23)
Average pre-test total (rater 1,2,3)	Pearson Correlation	1	.470**
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.003
Average post-test total (rater1,23)	Pearson Correlation	.470**	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.003	

### **PRETEST AND POSTTEST SCORE EXPERIMENTAL GROUP (AVERAGE SCORES BY 3 RATERS)**

The Table 6 indicates the moderate relationship between the average pretest and posttest scores of experimental group with the Pearson correlation value of 0.345 and the significant 2-tailed p value is .029 which is less than 0.05. Hence, the relationship is found to be statistically significant at 5% significance level.

**Table 6. Correlation of pre-test and post-test average scores of experimental group**

N=40		Average pre-test total (rater 1,2,3)	Average post-test total (rater1,23)
Average pre-test total (rater 1,2,3)	Pearson Correlation	1	.345*
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.029

Average post-test total (rater1,2,3)	Pearson Correlation	.345*	1
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.029	

#### T-TEST TO COMPARE PRETEST SCORES OF CONTROL AND EXPERIMENT GROUPS

The table 7. shows the mean achievements of average pretest scores of CG and EG that is 10.16 in CG and 9.80 in EG which explains that both groups have a similar kind of competency. Moreover, in this table the first column shows number of participants of both groups, second column shows the mean values as mentioned above, the third column presents standard deviation in like manner fourth column illustrates the standard error.

**Table 7. One-Sample Statistics**

	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Control Average pre-test total (rater 1,2,3)	37	10.16	1.419	.233
Experimental Average pre-test total (rater 1,2,3)	40	9.80	2.178	.344

Whereas, table 8 shows t-test two sample assuming equal variance provide a prove that both groups in the pretest were homogenous and equal as the mean value is 10.21 and 9.775 t statistic's value is 1.04. so, the pretest values are statistically significant at 5% significance level.

**Table 8.T-Test: Two-Sample Assuming Equal Variances**

	Variable 1	Variable 2
Mean	10.21621622	9.775
Variance	1.951951952	4.742949
Observations	37	40
Pooled Variance	3.40327027	
Hypothesized Mean Difference	0	



Df	75
t Stat	1.048549026
P(T<=t) one-tail	0.148876485
t Critical one-tail	1.665425373
P(T<=t) two-tail	0.297752971
t Critical two-tail	1.992102154

### T-TEST TO COMPARE POSTTEST SCORES OF CONTROL AND EXPERIMENTAL GROUPS

The Table 9 shows the mean values of the control group and experimental group post test scores that is mean of (CG) was 16.81 and mean of (EG) was 19.94. These mean values show a productive difference between these groups. The data supports GABI, as t value in experimental group was 117.359 which is greater than the t value of control group that was 50.077, the second column shows the degree of freedom(df) having the value of 36 and 39 the third column shows the significant value or p value based on which we accept or reject  $H_0$ .

**Table 9. One-Sample Statistics**

	N	Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Control Average post-test total (rater1,23)	37	16.81	2.042	.336
Experimental Average post-test total (rater1,23)	40	19.94	1.075	.170

The Table 10 shows the mean value of posttest of control group is 16.86 and the EG mean value in the posttest is 20 that show significant difference that means we reject null hypotheses that is there is no difference in the writing scores of post-tests and accept alternative hypotheses that is there is difference in the posttest of both groups. Post scores of EG was higher than the CG which provide sufficient evidence to conclude that GABI was more effective than CBCBI.

**Table 10.t-Test: Two-Sample Assuming Equal Variances**

	Variable 1	Variable 2
Mean	16.8648649	20

Variance	4.23123123	1.128205
Observations	37	40
Pooled Variance	2.61765766	
Hypothesized Mean Difference	0	
Df	75	
t Stat	-8.4954294	
P(T<=t) one-tail	6.7967E-13	
t Critical one-tail	1.66542537	
P(T<=t) two-tail	1.3593E-12	
t Critical two-tail	1.99210215	

## THEMATIC ANALYSIS OF QUALITATIVE DATA

### COMPARISON OF CONTROL AND EXPERIMENTAL GROUPS PREVIOUS WRITING EXPERIENCES

In response to the question about their previous writing experiences of job application letter, 99% participants in the control group shared their views that they have not written JAL before and they had no idea about this genre. Only 1 participant responded that he had written a JAL when he applied for the job (see table 11.)

**Table 11.: Theme:1 Control group students previous writing experiences of JAL**

Sub-themes	Participant's code and responses	Frequency
1) Never written before / No idea	C066-C099, C104-C312: 'No', C070 'Never'  C076: '(Never written one)'	(N=42)
2) Applying for job	C-102: 'Yes (When I was applying for a job in a coaching center)'	(N=1)

Whereas, in the experimental group 90% of the participants had no writing experience of JAL and those who had, they first written in the business communication class during the tenure of the researcher's experiment and one of them responded that he was willing to learn, Hence, majority of the participants

answered that they had written job application letter first time in the business communication and ethics class, some of them replied that they had written when they applied for job and internship (see table 12.).

**Table 12.: Theme:1Experimental group students previous writing experiences of JAL**

Sub-themes	Participant's code and responses	Frequency
1) <b>No writing experience/ first writing experience in Business communication and Ethics Class</b>	<p>T002, T005, T006, T008, T019, T027, T055, T057, T058, T063, T064, T065, T240 'No' T045: 'No (Never)' T061 'No (I am willing to learn)'</p> <p>T007: 'yes (Last Tuesday in business communication class)' T009: (yesterday in business communication class', T010: (A class assignment given yesterday) T012: (During exams and class activity)' T017: (Yesterday in business communication class, T020: (in Business communication class) T021: (14th Feb,2017 in Business communication class) T022: '(in yesterday 's class) T023, T046, T048: '(yesterday) T025, T026, T031, T032, T034, T036, T037, T044, T054, T059, T303: 'yes (During a class activity)' T029, T038, T042, T053, T060, T132: '(During business communication class), T047: '(Just wrote it for an activity in the class and it was for the first time.'</p>	(N= 43)
2) <b>Applying for job/ internship</b>	<p>T001: 'Yes (After completing the HSC, I applied to teach in ' The innocent high school', T003: 'Yes (internship application letter)', T004: 'During 2016, previous year applying for internship in T011: 'Yes (when I was applying for teaching in coaching Centre) T012: 'T014: 'I wrote a job application for customer engineering services 5 months before' T015: 'yes (applying for internship)', T016: 'yes (for internship) T018: 'yes (Few days ago applied for internship)', T035: 'yes (Last year when I went to teach in the " The optima of science collegiate"'T040: 'yes ( Last year , internship letter) T049: 'Yes (Last year, when I went to teach in the optima of science collegiate, Karachi. T062: 'Yes (Internship application Letter)'</p>	(N=12)

Hence, the findings revealed that there was a gap in the teaching and writing of this JAL in the both groups. Both groups are homogenous and equivalent.

## COMPARISON OF CONTROL AND EXPERIMENTAL GROUP OF PARTICIPANT'S CURRENT PERCEPTIONS OF JAL WRITING

In response to the open-ended question that sought student's current perceptions of JAL's major elements, ideas and content after teaching instructions to scrutinize their responses about writing accomplishment they had attained after teaching input. The data revealed several patterns or sub-themes that are targeted in both groups are as follows: In the control group, participants responded that they follow the proper pattern while writing JAL, they were aware of A.I.D.A approach, ending letter with positive tone, awareness of language use, sentence pattern, mechanics of writing. Additionally, they are also aware of the content-writing strategy, its organizational pattern, how to use convincing statements for catching employer's attention, improvement in writing skills in terms of choice of words and how to use professional phrases. In contrast, thematic analysis in the experimental group revealed similar findings or responses but the only difference was the understanding of sequence of move structure in the experiment group was observed. In conclusion, the given data has provided evidence about the current writing experiences of JAL that the participants in the EG are aware of the sequence of moves in the JAL, they have good knowledge of vocabulary and expressions that sells one's candidate. They know the structured pattern of solicited and unsolicited JAL, Participants also possess knowledge of convincing statements to impress the employers by staying humble and by being polite.

## COMPARISON OF PARTICIPANT'S RESPONSES BEFORE AND AFTER WRITING INSTRUCTIONS OF THE CONTROL AND EXPERIMENTAL GROUP

The Table 13. displayed contrastive change in the participants writing perceptions and practices earlier and after teaching instruction of both groups but the main difference is the awareness of moves present only in the experimental group. Control group did not receive this treatment.

**Table13: Comparison of pre and post-writing perceptions of the participants of CG and EG**

Pre- participant's perceptions of JAL writing (CG&EG)	Post- participant's perceptions of JAL writing (CG &EG)	Difference in the control and Experimental group
<b>Similarities</b>		
1) Not aware of the format and style of writing	1)Learned the structured pattern of writing JAL, not letting the receiver to get bored using standard format	
2) Lacking ideas in the usage of vocabulary and writing specific expressions	2) Learnt the usage of professional phrases and place of insertion, awareness of using proper vocabulary	
3) Problems in the use of grammar, language and mechanics	3)Corrected my mistakes that I did in the past, awareness of how to	

	write the grammatically correct JAL.
4) How to write convincing statements for employers	4) learnt specific skills and strategies to impress the employer.
5) Development of ideas, writing methodology	5) learnt correct approach of writing JAL through AIDA and awareness of presentation of ideas sequentially.
6) How to develop writing, speaking skills	6) Technical writing skills were developed, improved communication and speaking skills
7) Elements	7) Learnt elements of JAL.

Both groups had similar responses, but the only difference was the understanding of the move structure of JAL

The findings of the study show the considerable impact of GABI in the post test of the participants of the experimental group. The statistical and thematic analysis of the data provides prove that GABI provides explicit instructions of the target genre in terms of moves analysis. This pedagogy gives teachers a resourceful guideline for the formulation of effective genre. Besides this, it also gives learners platform to identify the specific features of any genre. Thus, it proved that in order to understand the structure of any text or genre this instruction is helpful and beneficial for learners.

## CONCLUSION

The present study attempts to compare the existing pedagogy (CBCBI) with the proposed pedagogy (GABI) for JAL writing in order to see their impact on students' writing competence. Genre based pedagogy provides a platform for teachers and learners. As quality teaching at tertiary level is required so that learner's meet the global demand and develop professionally as well. Using the quasi-experimental research design, the comparison is made to see the impact of CBCBI and GABI on the students' performance and their test scores. The current study bridges the gap by providing Pakistani graduates that how professional discourse is written, how improvement of employment communication take place, how to compose a new genre with the help of moves, how to promote themselves in the professional targeted field. It also bridges the gap by providing teachers the idea of moves and the application of professional writing skills by using GABI. This study also sensing the gap of the undergraduate learners in professional writing skills at a public-sector engineering university studying business communication course. As undergraduate learners had a little competency in writing professional genre, it requires explicit instructions so that learners become

aware of the communicative purpose of each move of a target genre. Hence, in terms of empowering ESP students with the formulaic expressions, linguistic features, format and structure, usage of professional vocabulary, inspirational expressions for persuasion that are used for the construction of text, it requires explicit instructions and GABI provide all these instructions.

Henceforth, the impact of two pedagogies were investigated by using the genre of JAL with intact groups control and experimental, 5<sup>th</sup> semester undergraduate student's writing performance. During the tenure of teaching both groups were exposed to the range of resourceful materials according to their assigned writing instructions. Additionally, pretest and posttest were conducted to see the difference in the student's scores. Data analysis proved that improvement in students writing performance, development of confidence in handling the professional genre with their moves structures. Thus, GABI proves a suitable alternative pedagogy. This pedagogy could be used to teach business communication course at the tertiary level.

## REFERENCES

- Ain, Q. U., Mahmood, M. A., & Qasim, S. (2015). Generic and lexico-grammatical patterns of Job application letters sent to the educational Institutes of Faisalabad. *ELF Annual Research Journal*, 17, 163-182. Retrieved from [https://www.academia.edu/21981645/Generic\\_and\\_Lexico-grammatical\\_Patterns\\_of\\_Job\\_Application\\_Letters\\_Sent\\_to\\_the\\_Educational\\_Institutes\\_of\\_Faisalabad](https://www.academia.edu/21981645/Generic_and_Lexico-grammatical_Patterns_of_Job_Application_Letters_Sent_to_the_Educational_Institutes_of_Faisalabad).
- Al-Ali, M. N. (2004). How to get yourself on the door of a job: A cross-cultural contrastive study of Arabic and English job application letters. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 25(1), 1-23. DOI: 10.1080/01434630408666517.
- Ashraf, H., & Rarieya, J. F. (2008). Teacher development through reflective conversations—possibilities and tensions: a Pakistan case. *Reflective practice*, 9(3), 269-279.
- Babbie, E., (2008). *The basics of social science*. Fourth edition. Thomson: Wadsworth
- Bratlien, M.J., McGuire, M.A., (2002). *Teachers for our nation's school*. Paper presented at Phi Delta kappa district III conference Tulsa, Oklahoma. ERIC document reproduction service no. ED 471012.
- Breaugh, J. A., & Starke, M. (2000). Research on employee recruitment: So many studies, so many remaining questions. *Journal of management*, 26(3), 405-434.
- Chaudary, I. A. (2011). A new vision of professional development for tertiary teachers in Pakistan. *Professional Development in Education*, 37(4), 633-637.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2007). Experiments, quasi-experiments, single case research and meta-analysis. *Research Methods in Education*. (6th ed.). pp.272-295. London and NY: Routledge.
- Dar, M.F., Zaki, S. & Kazmi, H.H. (2010). Students' reactions regarding the use of process strategy for oral presentations in ESP, *English Language and Literary Forum*, Vol. 12, pp.1-12.

- Dayoub, R., & Bashiruddin, A. (2012). Exploring English-language teachers' professional development in developing countries: Cases from Syria and Pakistan. *Professional Development in Education*, 38(4), 589-611. DOI: 10.1080/19415257.2011.649986
- Ding, H., & Ding, X. (2013). 360-degree rhetorical analysis of job hunting: A four-part, multimodal project. *Business Communication Quarterly*, 76(2) 239–248. DOI: 10.1177/1080569912475207.
- Florida department of Education (2005). *Data Analysis for instructional leaders*. NEFEC. retrieved from on 25<sup>th</sup> <https://www.floridaschoolleaders.org/general/content/NEFEC/dafil/lesson2-5.htm>.
- Freed, M., Ashraf, A., & Bilal, M. (2016). ESL Learners' Writing Skills: Problems, Factors and Suggestions. *Journal of Education and Social Sciences*. 4(2): 1, 81-92.
- Hativa, N., Barak, R., & Simhi, E. (2001). Exemplary university teachers: Knowledge and beliefs regarding effective teaching dimensions and strategies. *The journal of higher education*, 72(6), pp.699-729.
- Henry, A., & Roseberry, R. L. (2001). A narrow-angled corpus analysis of moves and strategies of the genre: 'Letter of Application'. *English for Specific Purposes*, 20(2), pp.153-167. doi:10.1016/S0889-4906(99)00037-X
- Ho, A., Watkins, D., & Kelly, M. (2001). The conceptual change approach to improving teaching and learning: An evaluation of a Hong Kong staff development programme. *Higher Education*, 42(2), pp. 143-169
- Hyland, K. (1990). A genre description of the argumentative essay. *RELC Journal*, 21(1), pp.66-78. DOI: 10.1177/003368829002100105.
- Hyland, K. (2004). *Genre and second language writing*. Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan Press.
- Hyland, K. (2007). Genre pedagogy: Language, literacy and L2 writing instruction. *Journal of second language writing*, 16(3), 148-164. doi: 10.1016/j.jslw.2007.07.005.
- Kay, H., & Dudley-Evans, T. (1998). Genre: What teachers think. *ELT Journal*, 52(4), 308-314.
- Khan, A., & Tin, T. B. (2012). Generic patterns in application letters: The context of Pakistan. *RELC Journal*, 43(3), pp.393-410. DOI: 10.1177/0033688212463277.
- Kwan, B. S.C. (2006). The schematic structure of literature reviews in doctoral theses of applied linguistics. *English for Specific Purposes*, 25(1), pp.30-55. doi: 10.1016/j.esp.2005.06.001.
- Lee, N. K. (2013). The Genre-based Writing Instruction in EFL. *Language Research*, 49(2), 311-332.
- Mahmood, M. A., Ain, Q., Umer, A., & Qasim, S. (2015). Linguistic Interpretations of Pakistani Job Application Letters. *Journal of Literature, Languages and Linguistics*, 9. ISSN 2422-8435.
- Osman, H. (2004). Genre-based instruction for ESP. *The English Teacher*, 33, pp.13-29.

- Payaprom, S. (2012). *The impact of genre-based approach on English language teaching in an EFL tertiary context in Thailand* (Dissertation, University of Wollongong, Australia).
- Pryde, M. (2015). Teaching language learners to elaborate on their responses: A structured, genre-based approach. *Foreign Language Annals*, 48(2), 168-183. DOI: 10.1111/flan.12135.
- Ramsden, P. (1987). Improving teaching and learning in higher education: The case for a relational perspective. *Studies in Higher Education*, 12(3), pp. 275-286.
- Rizvi, M., & Elliott, B. (2007). Enhancing and sustaining teacher professionalism in Pakistan. *Teachers and Teaching: theory and practice*, 13(1), 5-19.
- Soroko, E. (2012). The Presentation of Self in Letters of Application: A Mixed-Method Approach. *Journal of Employment Counseling*, 49(1), pp. 4-17. DOI: 10.1002/j.2161-1920.2012.00002. x.
- Sultana, M., & Zaki, S. (2015). Proposing project based learning as an alternative to traditional ELT pedagogy at public colleges in Pakistan. *International journal for language and language studies*, 4(2) pp.155-173.
- Troyan, F. J. (2016). Learning to Mean in Spanish Writing: A Case Study of a Genre-Based Pedagogy for Standards-Based Writing Instruction. *Foreign Language Annals*. DOI: 10.1111/flan.
- Yang, W. H. (2012). A study of students' perceptions and attitudes towards genre-based ESP writing instruction. *The Asian ESP Journal Autumn Edition October 2012 Volume 8 Issue 3*, 50.
- Yasuda, S. (2011). Genre-based tasks in foreign language writing: Developing writers' genre awareness, linguistic knowledge, and writing competence. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 20(2), pp.111-133. doi:10.1016/j.jslw.2011.03.001.
- Zaki, S., & Rashidi, M. Z. (2013). Parameters of Quality in Higher Education: A Theoretical Framework. *International Journal of Social Sciences & Education*, 3(4),1098-1105.
- Zaki, S., Rashidi, Z., & Kazmi, H.H. (2013). Improving instructional practices: Where to begin? *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education*. Vol.7, No. 1, pp. 65-76.